Task Title	Is Your Claim on Thin Ice?
Grade Level	6
LAFS	LAFS.6.RI.3.8 Trace and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, distinguishing claims that are supported by reasons and evidence from claims that are not. LAFS.6.RI.1.1 Cite textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text. LAFS.6.W.1.1 Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence.
Description	The student will read an informational text and highlight text to identify the author's claim and relevant supportive text information that serves as evidence of the claim. Using a graphic organizer, the student will record the author's claims and list the supportive evidence. The student will use the graphic organizer information to plan, organize, and present his or her position in writing about the strength of the author's claim and supportive text evidence for the claim.
Materials	• Passage "On Thin Ice" (one copy per student) • Stating Claims with or without Support Graphic Organizer (one copy per student) • Pencils • Highlighters (two colors per student) • Projector, scanned-image LCD projector, document camera, or overhead projector • Informational article for modeling (teacher choice) • Teacher Checklist for Is Your Claim on Thin Ice?
Considerations for Planning	• This task may be bundled with three other tasks in this recommended order: LAFS.6.RI.3.8 "Is Your Claim on Thin Ice?," LAFS.6.RI.3.9 "Compare and Contrast Global Warming Articles." Students will have prior knowledge of how to determine the main idea. • Students will have prior knowledge of how to locate supporting details. • Students will have prior knowledge of identifying claims in a text. • Students will have prior knowledge of how to determine if a claim has supporting details or not. • Students will have prior knowledge of evaluating the quality of evidence and strength of a claim. **English Language Learner Considerations:** • Apply the ELL Considerations stated in the passage "On Thin Ice" as usable for this task and the LAFS. • ELLs may need clarification of the expression, "on thin ice," especially if they come from a tropical climate. Discuss the literal and figurative meaning of the expression. • ELLs may have difficulty with some vocabulary. Allow them to use a bilingual dictionary with definitions. • Give ELLs a word list with definitions for the following words: environment, expanse, adapt, aquatic, estimate, extinction, hibernation, and truncates.

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

	• Provide a definition for each type of author's purpose for the ELL to refer to while reading. • ELLs might not know what a claim is and how to find it. Provide student with a list of clue words that are used when a claim is made. • ELL may need additional guided instruction on how to identify a sound reason or evidence that supports a claim. ➢ Display and discuss an example of a well-written analytical response that cites evidence from the text about the strength of the author's claims. Include all the elements of a solid paragraph (e.g., main topic sentence, supporting details, transitions, concluding sentence, etc.) that are clearly labeled to serve as a model.
Time Allotment	30 minutes **English Language Learner Considerations:** Allow additional time for ELLs to present their position in writing about the strength of the author's claim and supportive text evidence for the claim.
Group Size	Whole class (modeling) / Individual (text coding) **English Language Learner Considerations:** Pair ELL with another student who has ample experience in writing solid analytical responses to texts.

Task Directions

1. Teacher introduces the activity and states the overall purpose, expectations for students, and why the activity is important. Teacher says, "The purpose of this activity is for you to identify the author's claim, follow the author's argument, and evaluate whether the argument and specific claims in text are valid. We are going to read an article titled "On Thin Ice" and determine what claim the author makes and if there is support in the article for the claims. You will do this by completing a graphic organizer. The ability to determine an author's claims and whether there is sufficient support for those claims will help you when you have to find information that is valid and reliable when speaking or writing your position about a topic."

   English Language Learners Considerations:
   At this point, teacher provides a very quick review of the types of reasons that can support a claim. Teacher says, "The claim is the position or stand the writer takes on one issue. These statements can be proven or verified by observation, research, or when considering one thing or idea as better or more desirable than another, but also an idea that suggests what should or ought to be done to solve a problem."

   Teacher continues: "Now, some examples about finding appropriate support for these claims are finding a reason or general statement that supports the claim. This explains why the writer's viewpoint is reasonable and should be accepted. Additional types of support include any sort of evidence such as facts, statistics, experiences, comparisons, or examples that demonstrate why the claim is valid. A final type of reason is an emotional appeal, which are ideas targeted toward needs or values that readers are likely to care about."

2. Teacher distributes to each student a copy of the article "On Thin Ice" and the Stating Claims with or without Support Graphic Organizer.

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

3. Teacher models the task using an informational article other than “On Thin Ice.” Teacher displays a copy of the article via overhead projector device. Teacher underlines the claim in a paragraph with one color pen or highlighter and then, with a different color pen or highlighter, underlines key words and phrases in text that supports the claim. Teacher asks students to differentiate between the text’s main idea and the author’s claim. Teacher asks students to distinguish the main idea’s supporting key words from those words and phrases that serve as evidence of the author’s claim. Teacher reminds students that sometimes there is no supporting text evidence for claims and at other times there is some but not enough text evidence to determine whether an author’s claim is strongly supported.

4. Teacher displays a copy of the Stating Claims with or without Support Graphic Organizer and fills in the following information:
    - claim made by the author
    - relevant text evidence that supports the author’s claim
    - evaluation of the author’s claim
    - counterargument with evidence or evidence from the text that supports opinion

5. Teacher directs students to read the article “On Thin Ice” silently and see if the author makes any claims. Students underline/highlight the claim in one color and then highlight/underline supports for that claim in another color.

6. After students complete annotating the text (highlighting/underlining claims and supports for claims), students then independently complete the Stating Claims with or without Support Graphic Organizer.

7. Teacher instructs students to use their graphic organizer to plan, organize, and write a paragraph that explains the author’s claim, the supportive text evidence for the claim, and the student’s position about the strength of the author’s claim and its evidence.

8. While students engage in the task, teacher observes, asks questions, and assists students. Teacher utilizes rubric to determine student performance based on common misconceptions/errors, identify appropriate questions to ask students to elicit evidence of student thinking, and determine next steps for instruction.

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Rubric: Is Your Claim on Thin Ice?

Level 1: The student demonstrates a **beginning understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
Student is unable to determine an author's claim or identify support for the claim. Student is unable to formulate and present a position in writing about the strength of the author's claim and the text evidence about the claim. **English Language Learner Misconceptions:** Due to lack of cultural background, ELLs may not understand the concepts of arguments, claims, and support and how to pull this information from the text. For instance, they may not know how to detect specific types of claims and support: Claim of fact, value, and policy (reasons, evidence, and emotional appeals). In some cases, ELLs may tend simply to copy and paste information from the text as a possible claim or reason; they still may not know how to explain it or develop it. The lack of knowledge of how to paraphrase	"What is the main thing the author is talking about in this paragraph? Is the author making any claims about ___? If so, why is the author saying that? How can you tell if that claim is true?" "If you had to find something in this article to argue about, what would it be? What facts does the author give to help you with that argument?" **English Language Learner Considerations:** "If you had to find something in this article to argue about, what would it be? What facts does the author give to help you with that argument?" "What do you think are the views or beliefs of the author in this text? What words or sentences helped you to think that?" "What do you believe the author is trying to prove or communicate to the reader? What is the purpose or claim of this reading selection?" "Do you see any explanation, example, fact, experience, or	Re-teach main idea, supporting details, argument, claims, and support. **English Language Learner Considerations:** Continue to teach ELLs the different types of claims (fact, value, and policy) as well as the different types of support (reasons, evidence, and emotional appeals) for inductive and deductive arguments. Teach ELLs strategies to find arguments. For instance, teach the following guiding questions: • What does the title suggest? • Who is the author, and what are his/her qualifications? • What is the date of publication? • What do I already know about this issue?

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Level 1: The student demonstrates a **beginning understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
information could be problematic for ELLs. Depending on the English language proficiency of a given ELL, the explanations to fill out the graphic organizer may be linguistically inaccurate with several mistakes in grammar, tense, and vocabulary. ELLs may confuse the rules of their native language when attempting to write in English, especially since sentence structures (syntax) vary greatly among languages.	emotional strategy used by the author to make the point or claim? Why do you think this is so?" Scaffold the task: "What's the first sentence of a paragraph called? (Discuss) How about we use your graphic organizer to write a topic sentence that states whether or not the author supports his/her claim?" (Guide grammar and sentence structures. Ask similar questions.) "How do we start a new sentence?" "How do we end a sentence?" "Who/what is your subject?" "Where is your verb?'" "What comes first, the subject or the verb? Did you do that?" "Now look at your organizer and tell me the first evidence from the text that the author used to support his/her claim. (Assist student in writing response.) Do you think that is solid evidence? Why? Why not?" "Where can we find a list of transitions to connect the next evidence the author uses to support his/her claim?" (Help ELL choose a transition and repeat the prior step to write the next sentences.)	Depending on the level of understanding of the ELL and his/her English language proficiency, teacher may have ELLs work on the same exercise in their native language (when resources and teacher's ability to understand the students' responses are present). Reteach basic grammar and sentence structures in English. Provide a simple list of common transitions. Guide ELLs to selecting one that best links their ideas. Reteach the stages of writing a solid paragraph (e.g., main topic sentence, supporting details, transitions, concluding sentence, etc.). Ask ELLs specific questions that elicit them to add relevant text information as evidence about strength of author's claim?

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Level 1: The student demonstrates a **beginning understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
	(Continue as necessary, according to the number of textual evidences the student puts on his/her graphic organizer.) “What is the last sentence of a paragraph called? (Guide ELL) How can you end this response? (If ELL struggles) How can you tell the reader whether or not the author’s claims are solid?”	

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Level 2: The student demonstrates **some understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
Student is able to determine an author's claim but is unable to identify support for the claim.	"If you had to argue that claim that the author made, what facts from the article could you use? Are there any facts, or do you have to go find them somewhere else?"	Review argument and how to determine if there is adequate support or not.
Student is able to identify support for a claim but is unable to determine the author's claim.	"What is the author trying to tell you in the sentence or paragraph?"	Review the distinction between main idea of paragraphs, author's purpose, and an author's claim.
Student presents an unclear position in writing about the strength of the author's claim and the text evidence for the claim.	"Why do you think the author included this detail?"	Review the distinction between key details in support of a main idea and those key words and phrases that support an author's claim.
English Language Learner Misconceptions:	**English Language Learner Considerations:**	**English Language Learner Considerations:**
ELLs still may not know how to determine what a claim is in the text. They may be able to identify the claim but be unable to explain it properly with evidence or support.	"What do you think are the views or beliefs of the author in this text?" "What words or sentences helped you to think that?"	Continue teaching ELLs the different types of claims and reasons to support them. Have them work in pairs or small groups with native speakers of English to provide feedback to each other.
In some cases, ELLs may still confuse the types of claims and provide the wrong explanation or interpretation of it in their graphic organizer. They may be unable to state if the claim is valid or not or may not be able to state if the claim is supported by the text or not.	"Do you believe the claim is (claims are) supported by the text? If so, where? What are some examples, explanations, evidence, or reasons from that?" "What type of support is validating the claim? Is it a fact, an example, an explanation, a reason, a statistic, or an emotional reason stated by	Review basic grammar and sentence structures in English. Review the steps to writing a solid paragraph (e.g., main topic sentence, supporting details, transitions, concluding sentence, etc.).
Some ELLs may be able to write and		Take students step by step through their paragraphs, asking questions that

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Level 2: The student demonstrates **some understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
complete portions of the graphic organizer but continue to lack sufficient vocabulary and experience using English grammar (syntax) to express supporting details.	the author?” (Note: The questions in Level 1 can also be used for Level 2, depending on the ELL’s writing ability.) Scaffold writing the response: "First we need to write a main topic sentence for your response. Tell the readers if you believe that the author does a good or bad job at citing evidence to support his/her claim.” “What evidence does the author cite to support his/her claim? What is your position? Please write a sentence about it. I can help you with any words you don't know.” “What other evidence does the author use? What do you think about that idea(s)? Which transition word can you use to connect your first idea and this one?” “Now all you need is a concluding sentence to end your summary. Tell the readers why you think the author did/did not give enough solid evidence to support his/her claim.”	guide them to improving their response.

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Level 3: The student demonstrates a **complete understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
Student is able to state the author's claim and identify support for the claim. Student may self-correct in the process of performing the task. Student presents a clear position in writing about the strength of the author's claim and the text evidence in support of the claim.	"Where can you find additional information to help support that claim?"	Allow student to research additional information to support or refute that claim from the article.

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Level 4: The student demonstrates an **advanced understanding** of evaluating arguments by determining specific claims in a text and identifying if there is support for that claim.		
Misconception/Error	Questions for Eliciting Thinking	Instructional Implications
Student has no misconceptions or errors.	"What information do you need to determine if that claim is valid?"	Provide resources for student to do additional research to determine the validity of the claim. Encourage the student to put his/her findings into writing.

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Teacher Checklist for
Is Your Claim on Thin Ice?

Q1 ***Does student identify the author's claim?***

Q2 ***Does student identify reasons and text evidence supporting the claim?***

Q3 ***Does student evaluate the strength of the claim?***

Q4 ***Does the student use relevant text information as evidence to present position in writing about strength of author's claim?***

	Identifies author's claim	***Identifies reasons and text evidence supporting the claim***	***Evaluates the strength of the claim***	***Uses relevant text information as evidence to present position in writing about strength of author's claim***	**Level 1, Level 2, Level 3, or Level 4**	**Observation notes**
Student Name	**Q1**	**Q2**	**Q3**	**Q4**		

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Name: _____ Date: _____

Stating Claims with or without Support

Directions: Using your highlighted text, complete the information below. Then use this information to write a paragraph that presents your position on the strength of the claim and its evidence.

Author's claim:

Evidence from the text that supports the author's claim:

My response to the author's claim is that his/her evidence is

____ not supported.

____ moderately supported.

____ strongly supported.

Write a counterargument with evidence or evidence from the text that supports your opinion.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Copyright
© 2014 NCS Pearson, Inc. Adapted and reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.